

Annex B: MAC Call for Evidence Questions for representative organisations

This document provides the list of questions contained in the MAC Call for Evidence online form. This is to help you gather your responses only, please use the online tool to submit your responses.

The questions below are for representative organisations providing their views on behalf of other organisations.

About you

1. What is the name of your organisation?

[The Heritage Alliance](#)

2. What is your email address?

policy@theheritagealliance.org.uk

3. Which of the following options best describe your reason for completing this form?

I am providing evidence of recruitment and salaries within my own organisation

[I am providing evidence of recruitment and salaries in the sector, on behalf of other organisations/members or as a recruitment business.](#)

The questions that follow in this form are for those that have chosen the second option in question 3.

About your organisation

4. Which of the following best describes your organisation?

Private sector

Public sector

[Third sector](#)

Other (please specify)

5. How many businesses /organisations do you represent?

Under 5

5- 49

[50- 499](#)

500- 5,000

5,000+

About the businesses/organisations you represent

6. How have you engaged the businesses/ organisations you represent to inform this consultation response?

Ongoing dialogue as part of business as usual

Specific events/contact arranged to discuss this consultation

Other (please specify):

7. Thinking of the businesses/organisations you have engaged with, in general are their staff concentrated in specific UK countries/regions or are they nation-wide?

Concentrated

Nation-wide

Question 8 is for only applicable if you have chosen the first option in question 7 (concentrated). For those that chose the second option (nation-wide) please answer question 9 onwards.

8. Following on from the previous question, which regions(s)/country(ies) are staff concentrated?

North East

North West

Yorkshire and The Humber

East Midlands

West Midlands

East of England

London

South East

South West

Scotland

Wales

Northern Ireland

England

9. Thinking of the businesses/organisations you engage with, tick all the relevant sectors they cover from the list below: (Please select all that apply)

For more information about the sectors please refer to the link below:

<http://resources.companieshouse.gov.uk/sic/>

Agriculture, Forestry and Fishing

Mining and Quarrying

Manufacturing

Electricity, gas, steam and air conditioning supply

Water supply, sewerage, waste management and remediation activities

Construction

Wholesale and retail trade; repair of motor vehicles and motorcycles

Transportation and storage

Accommodation and food service activities

Information and communication

Financial and insurance activities

Real estate activities

Professional, scientific and technical activities

Administrative and support service activities

Public administration and defence; compulsory social security

Education

Human health and social work activities

Arts, entertainment and recreation

Other service activities

Activities of households as employers; undifferentiated goods-

Activities of extraterritorial organisations and bodies

10. Thinking of the businesses/organisations you engage with and their number of employees, tick all size bands that they cover:

0-9 employees

10-49 employees

50-249 employees

250-499 employees

500+ employees

11. Thinking about the businesses/organisations you engage with, are the majority roughly of a similar size in terms of the number of employees (e.g most SMEs or most large organisations)?

Yes

No

Question 12 is only applicable if you have answered yes to question 11, if you have answered no please answer question 13 onwards.

12. Thinking of the businesses/organisations you engage with and their number of employees which size band(s) are they concentrated in?

0-9 employees

10-49 employees

50- 499 employees

500+ employees

Employment of migrant workers

13. To your knowledge, have the organisations you have engaged with recruited any of the following workers in the past 5 years: (Please select all that apply)

[Workers from EEA countries: the EEA includes all European Union (EU) countries plus Iceland, Liechtenstein and Norway. We also include Switzerland as part of our definition. Workers from non-EEA countries: workers from outside of EU countries plus Iceland, Liechtenstein Norway and Switzerland.]

UK and/or Irish workers

Workers from EEA countries outside of the UK and/or Ireland

Workers from non-EEA countries

Don't know

14. In the next 12 months are they likely to recruit: (Please select all that apply)

UK and/or Irish workers

Workers from EEA countries outside of the UK and/or Ireland

Workers from non-EEA countries

Don't know

Experience of Tier 2 (General) visa

Questions 15- 20 are only applicable if you have answered 'workers from non-EEA countries outside of the UK and/or Ireland' to question 13, others should complete question 21 onwards.

15. Following on from the previous question, were these non-EEA workers recruited under the Tier 2 (General) visa system?

Yes some

Yes all

No

Don't know

16. Are the salaries required by the Tier 2 (General) immigration rules generally:

Higher than what they would normally pay

About the same

Lower than they what would normally pay

Don't know

17. Have the organisations that you represent experienced any issues with Tier 2 (General) visa salary requirements? If so, what were they? (in 200 words)

Yes, the salary requirement for Tier 2 visa is too high compared to the average salary of the heritage sector. Even skilled workers on average receive salaries below the Tier 2 minimum salary requirement. Furthermore, some organisations struggle to afford the administrative costs to obtain a Tier 2 visa.

18. Have any of the Tier 2 (General) visa employees employed by your members (or organisations you represent) applied or tried to apply for settlement?

Yes

No

Don't know

The following questions should be answered by everyone.

Salary thresholds

Our commission from the government asks us to consider both the mechanism for setting minimum salary thresholds and the appropriate level.

21. To what extent would the businesses/organisations you have engaged with agree or disagree with the following statements: (strongly agree, agree, neither agree nor disagree, disagree, strongly disagree)

There should not be a minimum salary threshold above the legal requirement (the national minimum wage) **strongly agree**

If there is a salary threshold it should be applied universally across the economy and UK, with a few exceptions to keep the system simple **strongly disagree**

If there are salary thresholds, there need to be a variety to reflect employer needs **strongly agree**

If you have an alternative model you wish to describe, please explain it here (in 200 words)

In the heritage sector the proposed £30k minimum salary requirement is too high compared to the average salary (see also question 25). Many of the organisations we represent also use skilled and “unskilled” seasonal labour, which may not meet this salary requirement. If the Government proceeds with this approach to visas, it is important to mitigate against these proposals. Exemptions should be in place for accredited heritage experts, academics and heritage skills in a range of categories added to the UK shortage occupation list. At present several are lacking from the latest recommended list. (A full list of these can be found at Annex A of our [Heritage and Immigration Brexit Briefing](#)).

22. If there were tailored salary thresholds, to what extent would the businesses/organisations you have engaged with agree that they should be varied by: (strongly agree, agree, neither agree nor disagree, disagree, strongly disagree)

Sector **strongly agree**

Region/country **agree**

New entrants/young workers **agree**

Occupation **strongly agree**

23. Do the businesses/organisations you engage with most commonly think that jobs judged to be in shortage (such as those on the Shortage Occupation List) should have:

Higher salary thresholds compared to those not in shortage

The same salary thresholds compared to those not in shortage

Lower salary thresholds compared to those not in shortage

Don't know

24. Do the businesses/organisations you engage with most commonly think that having a salary threshold equivalent to the 25th percentile of the full-time pay distribution for employees in that occupation is:

[25th percentile: 75% of full-time employees in an occupation earn the threshold amount or more, and 25% earn less]

Too high

About right

Too low

Don't know

Please explain your answer (in 200 words)

Even in this case the threshold is above the average salary. It also depends on how this percentile is calculated: on all jobs in the country? on the same job across the country? or across the region? Even across the sub-sectors of heritage sector there are very different salary ranges. A blanket provision would therefore be inadequate for the heritage sector.

APPLIED FOR SECTOR

25. Do the businesses you engage with most commonly think that having a minimum salary requirement of £30,000 for an experienced full-time employee is:

Too high

About right

Too low

Don't know

Please explain your answer (in 200 words)

Our evidence shows that the average salary in our organisations ranges between £25,000 and £26,500. If a £30k minimum salary requirement were required, many jobs in the organisations we represent would not meet this criterion. Many of the organisations we represent reported that they anticipate their workload increasing in the future (e.g. with road and rail construction projects already planned or underway, energy infrastructure development, planning for resilience to climate change, large conservation projects such as the Palace of Westminster), exacerbating an existing skill gap. Half of the respondents to our survey believe that in their part of the sector the UK does not have enough labour at present to meet this increased need without access to EU nationals. This was particularly true for those working in archaeology and building conservation.

If a £30k minimum salary requirement is introduced, this could lead to an increase in delays and costs to the heritage sector (including archaeology, which also affects the construction sector). It would also take extra time and money to train new members of staff from scratch, which would put a huge strain on already limited resources for small organisations.

26. What do you think should be counted towards the salary for assessing whether an individual meets the threshold? (Please select all that apply)

Company car/ travel allowance 4

Pension contributions 2

Employee equity ownership schemes

Part-time working patterns 1

Commission

Housing allowances 3

Other cash/non-cash remuneration please specify (in 200 words):

N/A

27. Following on from the previous question, please list your responses in order of importance with 1 being the most important and 6/7 being the least.

Part-time working patterns 1

Pension contribution 2

Housing allowances 3

Company car / travel allowances 4

28. Are there any other issues we should consider? (in 200 words)

In the heritage sector a new Tier 1 visa is an opportunity that could be explored. However, the Tier 1 system requires the person to be deemed 'internationally exceptional', which is a subjective definition. There is anxiety about going down the Tier 1 route as the companies might be told at the end of the hiring process that the Appointed Candidate is not sufficiently 'exceptional' and it will be necessary to re-advertise the job.

It is necessary to build a system of accreditation or to use existing systems of accreditation to achieve a fair assessment of the 'exceptionality' of the candidates in the heritage sector. For example, in the archaeology sector the Chartered Institute for Archaeologists already has an accreditation system in place, which could be used for assessing 'exceptionality' in the archaeology sector.

A heritage equivalent of a Tier 5 visa should also be considered.

29. Please attach any additional evidence you would like us to consider

Latest available data shows that 13% of people working in UK applied archaeology in 2018 are non-UK EU citizens. Other sectors with a high percentage of non-UK EU nationals skilled workers are conservation of historic buildings and academic research. Many of the organisations we represent reported an existing skill gap in these sectors. All six conservators on a major painting restoration project recently were EU citizens.

More insights on immigration in the heritage sector can be found in our Heritage and Immigration Brexit Briefing, which should be read alongside our questionnaire responses: <https://www.theheritagealliance.org.uk/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/Heritage-and-Immigration-Brexit-Briefing.pdf>.

Australian Points Based System

30. The Government is considering adopting an Australian type Points Based System. In your opinion, please tell us the relative importance of the following characteristics typically used to award points to migrants by ranking them where 1 is the most important and 8/9 is the least important.

Language proficiency **4**

Having studied in the UK **5**

Work experience **2**

Age **7**

Education attainment **1**

Having a job offer **3**

Salary **8**

Priority occupations **6**

Other, please specify

MAC stakeholder database

31. Would you like to be added to our stakeholder database for future research purposes and updates on MAC work?

Yes

No

32. We may require follow-up to clarify or supplement your responses to the online form, or for follow-up research.

Do you consent to be contacted to clarify or supplement your responses?

Yes

No

This is the end of the form